Hard Facts on the Art Discovery Group Catalogue

Die Zukunft in Kunst- und Museumsbibliotheken: Digitale Wissensräume
Münster, 17 November 2016

It is a great honour to speak about the Art Discovery Group Catalogue on the occasion of the AKMB-Herbstfortbildung 2016 in Münster.

Background: two "crises"

The idea to connect online catalogues of selected art libraries and to create a virtual bibliographic tool for searching discipline-specific information goes back to the late 1990's. The first version of the *Virtual Catalogue of Art History* was launched in 1999. The catalogue unified the catalogue entries of the art historical holdings of two German universities and the Kubikat-consortium. By 2003 the first international partners, such as the Florentine IRIS consortium and the union catalogue of the French national museum libraries joined. The network and its virtual catalogue were called *artlibraries.net.* In the following years the number of partners grew considerably to more than 90 libraries in 15 different countries. Also targets such as Google Books and the Hathi Trust were included.

 The concept of a discipline-oriented, virtual catalogue of leading art libraries worldwide played an important role when discussions started in 2010 following the cessation of the publishing of the Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA).

Through conversations about the concern for international art bibliography funding, art librarians, art historians, publishers and information technologists in the American and European art historical community developed the Future of Art Bibliography (FAB) group. This group hosted international meetings to look for new ways of facilitating art historical research collaboratively. It was acknowledged that professional cooperation among scholars, librarians, and publishers was needed. The discovery of resources should be made much easier. The overall opinion was that we need to take advantage of what already exists digitally, in publishers' catalogues, in websites, in digital information that is available and to identify the gaps in what does not exist or is already discoverable.

The FAB initiative resulted in the need for a discovery environment for discipline specific information and sources. Part of the solution has been *artlibraries.net*, However, this system

had limitations. This vision to create a new freely available virtual art bibliography, *a common electronic research index as a power-plant for information research in art history*, emerged at the same time as the second crisis, the technical shortcomings of *artlibraries.net* appeared as a result of its popularity and ongoing expansion. A number of challenges had to be faced:

- The sometimes slow and inflexible federated search technology had to be replaced by an infrastructure that corresponds better to the current habit of searching and navigating in comprehensive data pools;
- The demand for displaying a de-duplicated hit list with facet-based filtering options as well as different ranking criteria had to be satisfied;
- It was recognized as indispensable to interconnect the catalogue entries of the participating libraries with bibliographic data from additional sources such as repositories, bibliographies, publishers' archives, review databases, Open Access publishing platforms and e-journal collections;
- The final product of the described vision needed to be based on realistic, reliable and long-term financial and operational outcomes.

Concept: discipline oriented discovery tool

In 2013 the FAB Group joined forces with the *Artlibraries.network Committee*. Inspired by the Adamnet group catalogue, a successful cooperation between Amsterdam libraries and OCLC, conversations started with OCLC representatives. Step-by-step, a scenario for transferring the bibliographic data of artlibraries.net partners to WorldCat and unifying them with the already existing pool as well as with additional sources was developed. In May 2014 the new tool for discipline specific retrieval was launched. We called it the Art Discovery Group Catalogue. Queries for bibliographical information are satisfied with access to records of connected libraries. The retrieval, or the discovery process, is enriched with additional sources like bibliographical databases, foremost for journal articles, full-text repositories, and image collections. The Art Discovery Group Catalogue started with 30 participating libraries and currently about 60 libraries are connected, some individual, some through networks. Also important is the geographical division over 15 different countries which, in my view, are impressive.

What happened to Artlibraries.net? More and more libraries signed off during 2015. Not only the success of the new group catalogue but mainly because of the financial difficulties of the internet firm Janus Media that stopped maintenance of the interface, Artlibraries.net was shut down at the end of 2015.

Artlibraries.net was a meta search interface based on the technology of the Karlsruhe Virtual Catalogue (Virtueller Katalog Karlsruhe), which conducted a simultaneous search in a number of web catalogues. As artlibraries.net did not have its own database, it depended on the availability of target systems. Artlibraries.net produced standardized short-title hit lists.

The WorldCat data harvesting model offers significant advantages over the distributed search model. It enables a single, consolidated result set, better response times and a more robust search service. With the distributed search model there is a limited number of targets that can be effectively accommodated; this is overcome with the data harvesting model.

In this new model, there are two containers: the Worldcat database and the OCLC Central Index.

The metadata in de Worldcat database are:

- Library records
- Open Access Repositories

The metadata in the Central Index are:

- Article citations (ArticleFirst, CrossRef, British Library Serials, Elsevier, etc.)
- Provider collections (EBSCO, ProQuest, JSTOR, etc.)

The Art Discovery Group Catalogue is a "slice" from both containers with a discovery interface. From the single result set it is possible to display facets for narrowing the results, the presentation includes thumbnail images and the scope of the display can be expanded, from group catalogue to libraries world-wide.

Discovering the Art Discovery Group Catalogue

To demonstrate the importance of articles in the group catalogue, I would like to present a search on the author *Jan Simane.*

- 47 results are displayed.
- On the first page of the result list there are 3 articles and one computer file displayed.

- More and more articles and files are accessible full text. This is a feature highly rewarded by scholars and students.
- However, the retrieved article in Art Libraries Journal is mentioned twice. The reason is that it is loaded from Kubikat as a separate record in WorldCat and also by CrossRef indexed by the Central Index.

This example shows the display of articles in the Art Discovery Group Catalogue. The basic concept is the display of those article records with holdings of a journal in one or more of the participating libraries. The holding information is based on ISSN. Since the journal *Art Libraries Journal* is held by one or more of the participating libraries, in this example the Rijksmuseum Research Library, the article record is shown. The 800.000 Kubikat articles will become a source in the article citation sector of the Central Index in the near future.

I would like to search on the author with a more complex name structure *Jan Daan van Da.,*

- As a result 57 results are retrieved because the engine finds records on the separate elements of this name.
- Putting the full name between quotation marks gives a more precise result: 19 hits.
- An even more precise result list can be obtained by using of the filters: by choosing the two name variants offered: *Dam, Jan Daan van*, and: *Dam, Jan Daniël va*n.
- Choosing the record for the exhibition catalogue "De Lelijke Tijd": there is a full description available which shows the merging of subject terms in 3 different languages from 4 different libraries.
- There is also a link to the records in the local catalogues of holding libraries, in this example the Rubenianum in Antwerp.

A more complex search is the combination of an artist name and a subject *Vincent van Gogh and disease*

- The combination of the name *"Vincent van Gogh"* - between quotation marks - and *disease* results in many articles about his mental problems published in medical scientific journals. In the catalogues of the art historical libraries these articles would probably never been found.
- Many of the articles appearing in scientific medical and natural history journals are part of the more general collections of the universities of Texas, Princeton, Columbia,

Dresden and Heidelberg. Since the art libraries of these universities have no unique OCLC identification numbers, these collections can't be separated from the whole.

- Recently a filter was installed to exclude these general American university collections from the result list, in order to have a more specific art historical oriented result.

In the Art Discovery Group Catalogue we only see results that are from the configured group. When one of the libraries in the group has a holding on a journal, all the articles from those journals will surface in the results. That's the reason we see so many articles, but also articles from journals that have no relation to art. As long as any member of the Art Libraries group has a holding on a journal those indexed articles will show up in the search results. However, the 'problem' is not the 'predominance' of material from other disciplines but the concept of the discovery layer on WorldCat. If you like to have only discipline relevant results you have to filter out most of the Metadata in the Central Index. These co-called 'wrong' hits in this example are coming from databases like CrossRef, British Library Serials, Elsevier and others. But if we want to have the famous 'additional sources' in a discovery experience we can hardly renounce to search these sources.

One last search to demonstrate the use of filters: *Albrecht Dürer.*

- An impressive number of 8,154 hits on *Albrecht Dürer*
- Filtering geographical might reduce the number of hits, for example on American art libraries 3,378 hits,
- or German art libraries 4,376 hits.
- Again many articles shown in the results include relevant articles from other disciplines. On this screenshot I give an impression of the many different formats you might choose from.
- By choosing the format *e-book* 135 results are displayed.
- Clicking on the title *Albrecht Dürer: his engravings and woodcuts* the record is displayed. The electronic version is made available by three different providers. However, the Google option is blocked for copyright reasons.
- The Internet archive option opens a new screen and the book is full-text readable and even downloadable.

These are just a few examples of the many possibilities to search and filter the results.

The organisation of the Art Discovery Group Catalogue

The Art Discovery Project has been developed by an international project group within the context of the Future of Art Bibliography initiative, with the members of the artlibraries.net committee acting as the core taskforce.

The relation to OCLC should be made clear. Art Discovery is a project of the international art libraries community, managed by the taskforce. Art Discovery is not a service provided by OCLC, but it is using the infrastructure developed for WorldCat. The libraries included in the group catalogue are proposed and accepted by the taskforce. As a result of using the infrastructure developed for WorldCat, libraries have to sign an agreement with OCLC and secondly pay an annual subscription fee and a one-time set-up fee to join Art Discovery.

Joining the Art Discovery Group Catalogue. How to become a partner?

If you are responsible for an art library wherever in the world and your holdings are catalogued following international standards in terms of cataloguing rules and data structure then send us a description of the collection profile. A request for becoming partner in the Art Discovery Group Catalogue can be made at any time in an informal way by contacting the project manager or one of the committee members. There is a "contact button" on the home page of the Artdiscovery website. Participating in the group catalogue is with costs, referring to a one-time fee for loading your data to WorldCat (if this is not already the case) and to an annual maintenance share. In both cases, the amount depends on the size of your library.

The initial prices were fixed by OCLC and are subject to an annual rise according to the price index of the Netherlands and exchange rates. A short overview:

1.   Annual subscription fee

Categories 1 and 2 = libraries that meet all prerequisites through existing agreements with OCLC:

Collection size	**EUR 2014**	**USD 2014**	**EUR 2016**	**USD 2016**
< 10,000	358.75	484	366	494
< 200,000	461.25	625	471	637
> 200,000	666.25	900	680	918

Category 3 = libraries that have no current agreement for WorldCat on FirstSearch or (in EMEA) an agreement for visibility in WorldCat.org:

Collection size	EUR 2014	USD 2014	EUR 2016	USD 2016
< 10,000	871.25	1,176	889	1,200
< 200,000	973.75	1,315	994	1,341
> 200,000	1,076.25	1,455	1,098	1,485

This fee only includes participation in the WorldCat Group Catalogue. It does not include WorldCat on FirstSearch; it does not include cataloguing and does not include a metadata conversion or batch load.

2.   One-time set-up fee

EUR 2014	USD 2014	EUR 2016	USD 2016
307	414	318	428

I will not go into much detail about the data loading procedures. There are two procedures:

1. Your records are already available in Worldcat. There will be a selection of titles for inclusion in the group catalogue based on the holdings of the library.
2. Your records have to be loaded in Worldcat. The process basically consists of:
   - Matching with existing records
   - Merging of holding information

Why joining: what is the added value

Why, if your results are already in WorldCat do you need to join Art Discovery? It does look like an extra layer of bureaucracy and costs that a lot of smaller or less financially endowed libraries would stay out of, even though their holdings would be a huge asset. There are several reasons why libraries should join. The ideological reason is to join forces with other art libraries worldwide to build on this collaborative bibliographic tool for art related research and make the range of coverage as broad as possible. Another reason is to make your collections more visible for art historians. A leading study by Ithaka S+R called *Supporting the Changing Research Practices of Art Historians* pointed out the specific desire of many scholars for a single discipline-based research tool. In my experience at the Rijksmuseum, curators and conservators rarely search separate bibliographic databases like Art Index, BHA and IBA. They simply forget about their existence, they do not remember were to find them, or it takes too much effort. Joining Art Discovery is all about adding value to your collections.

At several occasions, during Question and Answer sessions, questions about added value and specific benefits were pertinent. I list a few answers:

- First discipline-specific view of Worldcat records

- It enables discovery of aggregated bibliographic data from participating libraries

- Simultaneous searching of 1900 databases + millions of journal articles and e-books from WorldCat Central Index

- Searches are easily expandable to the whole of WorldCat

- Scalable – unlimited number of libraries and unlimited number of users

- Incorporating digital content such as archives and images

- Digital Collection Gateway tool enables uploading of metadata digital content

- Operational capacity to become an increasingly comprehensive tool for art history study, scholarship and research

- Participating improves the exposure of your records

The added value of ADGC is a lot more than just combining a group of art libraries in WorldCat and hoping we get relevant results, it's the community around it and the education it can provide which should make it really interesting.

Content

Recently, OCLC introduced the new user interface and experience for Art Discovery. In the new experience, looks and feels have been improved. But most important is that it paved the way to integrate the SCIPIO database of auction catalogues. SCIPIO is a gateway to more than 300,000 auction and sales catalogues from the sixteenth century to the present. The metadata of this important, license-based source are now searchable in the Art Discovery environment. The SCIPIO database and Worldcat can be searched in combination, since the superset of all indexes became available. This is a feature unique to the Art Discovery Group Catalogue.

On this slide I list a number of future developments. Most important is the integration of more databases important for art historical research. Recently we were approached by Brill Publishers. Brill offers the metadata of Art Sales Catalogues Online and the iconographical database Arkyves for free for inclusion in the Central Index, and preferably to be searched

with the Art Discovery interface as a separate database (as SCIPIO). The Getty Research Portal, the BHA and RILA are also on our wish list.

Furthermore, repositories of interest and with a relationship to our discipline like image collections, museum archives and so on can be integrated in the discovery environment when certain technical and legal requirements are satisfied. Some local catalogues for instance the Arcade Catalogue of the NYARC libraries contains thousands of records for photo-archive images of works of art and documentation files which are not in WorldCat. It might be of great importance to add these records.

Website

To provide more background information and to make the Art Discovery Group Catalogue more visible, a website was launched. On the home page the image carrousel is prominently placed. Other features are:

- The Art Discovery search box is embedded within the site
- News about past and forthcoming events and introduction of new members
- Tab with lists and links to the participating libraries
- Tab with links to papers about the ADGC in the news and events section
- Tab for sponsors and partners
- Tab for information about the history of the project
- Footer with contact information of the project manager artdiscoverynet@gmail.com

The committee is currently working on improvements of the website to provide more information as a result of questions asked.

Upcoming:

- Information about the content including added value
- Information about searching the catalogue
- How to become a member and pricing information
- RSS feed

Use and feedback

November 2015: 663 users

December 2015:   796 users

January 2016:   925 users

February 2016:   1,538 users

March 2016:   2,307 users

April 2016:   2,151 users

May 2016:   1,979 users

June 2016:   1,885 users

July 2016:   1,664 users

August 2016:   1,734 users

September 2016:   1,663 users

October 2016:   1,974 users

Most users are from France, Germany and Italy, together almost 50%. The use is stable and reviews are positive but still scarce, although doubts have been expressed by scholars and subject specialists because of the lack of scope, the limitations of subject specific searches and the multiple listing of the same article records. Since the introduction a lot have been improved, especially in better search and sorting algorithms and a new and more user friendly search interface.

How valuable such a discipline-specific view into the larger WorldCat pool can be, will depend on the future use and development. I am hopeful that we will be able to expand the breadth of the group catalogue over time, both in the number of participating libraries, but also by adding on certain discipline-specific tools and more digital collections in order to move toward the vision of a central and global discovery system for art historical bibliography. Those 60 libraries from 15 countries have already signed up to participate seems a strong vote of confidence that this project might be on the right track. I strongly believe that with bibliographical and digital repositories expanding exponentially, there need to be technical solutions to help researchers find trusted information. It is possible that if Art Discovery is successful and keeps evolving, it could also relieve the need for libraries to purchase and implement expensive and untested commercial discovery products.

Thank you for your attention and interest in Art Discovery.

Geert-Jan Koot

Project Manager Art Discovery Group Catalogue

Artdiscoverynet@gmail.com

Some useful links

Website designed for the Art Discovery Group Catalogue http://artdiscovery.net

Art Discovery Group Catalogue interface: http://artlibraries.on.worldcat.org/discovery

Adamnet Group Catalogue: http://adamnet.worldcat.org/

Artlibraries.net: http://artlibraries.net/

WorldCat database: http://worldcat.org/

Background articles and presentations by the committee members about Art Discovery Group Catalogue: http://artdiscovery.net/art-libraries/

WorldCat® Discovery Services, *Content available through WorldCat Discovery Services* 28 October 2016 https://oclc.org/content/dam/oclc/worldcat-discovery/contentlist.xls

OCLC Products and Services, *WorldCat® Digital Collection Gateway, a Self-Service Tool for Uploading the Metadata of your Digital Content to WorldCat* https://oclc.org/digital-gateway.en.html

OCLC Member Stories, *Rijksmuseum Facilitate Research through Group Catalogs* http://www.oclc.org/member-stories/rijksmuseum.en.html

Press release 1 May, 2014: http://oclc.org/news/releases/2014/201415dublin.en.html
Video clip 26 August 2014: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Wzg8wqw7e58

A shorter version was embedded on the second page of the *OCLC 2013-2014 Annual Report*: http://oclc.org/en-US/annual-report/2014/our-members.html

Ars Hoya, a blog from Georgetown University Library opens with: "The biggest art catalogue in the world. This May [2014] a federated search catalogue exclusively for art debuted in the US. The Art Discovery Group Catalogue is huge, free, and works equally well for the research needs of both undergraduates or the advanced researcher." https://blogs.commons.georgetown.edu/ajs299/2014/05/28/the-biggest-art-catalogue-in-the-world/

Codart ezine, *New Art Discovery Group Catalogue launches. International group leads project to bring together art library catalogues in WorldCat,* Wednesday, 14 May 2014 http://www.codart.nl/news/1086/

Martien Versteeg, Het drie vakken gebied, UBA-blog voor ACW, CI en KG (University of Amsterdam Library blog) *Posts Tagged 'Art Discovery Group Catalogue'* 23 May 2014. http://martien128.wordpress.com/tag/art-discovery-group-catalogue/

Ithaka S+R, *Supporting the Changing Research Practices of Art Historians*, 2014 http://www.sr.ithaka.org/sites/default/files/reports/SR_Support-Changing-Research-ArtHist_20140429.pdf

Author credit

Geert-Jan Koot

Head of the Rijksmuseum Research Library

Museumstraat 1, (P.O. Box 74888)

NL-1070 DN Amsterdam, Netherlands

Email: g.koot@rijksmuseum.nl

Project manager of the Art Discovery Group Catalogue on behalf of the international working group within the context of the Future of Art Bibliography initiative, with the members of the artlibraries.net committee acting as the taskforce.